

# THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY

VOL. No. 48, No. 1



182

DECEMBER 13, 1954

WHOLE No. 1180

## CONTENTS

S. Dow: The Bibliography of Classical Studies . . . . .	1
Notice to Readers and Librarians . . . . .	7
The Publication Schedule of the current volume appears on the inside Masthead, page 2.	

### THE BIBLIOGRAPHY OF CLASSICAL STUDIES

#### A REVIEW ARTICLE

**J. A. Nairn's Classical Hand-List.** Edited by B. H. BLACKWELL LTD. Third edition. Oxford: B. H. Blackwell Ltd., 48-51 Broad St., 1953. Pp. viii, 164. 12s. 6d.; interleaved, 22s. 6d. (delivered in the USA, postage and insurance included, \$1.85; \$3.29, respectively).

The one bibliography of all Classical fields has been issued in a revised edition. It is excellent in its selections, compact, and surprisingly cheap, yet extensive enough so that its Index lists over 2000 scholars.

*Compilers; Date.* The new edition is an extensive revision and enlargement, carried out by A. W. P[ullan], with help from T. J. Dunbabin, M. V. Taylor, C. M. Kraay, W. S. Watt, J. R. Stewart, and S. Weinstock. The volume reflects credit on all, past and present, who have made it. The last edition was of 1939; the new one evidently went to press at the end of 1952. O. Brogan's *Roman Gaul* and at least two other titles were evidently known 'of 1953,' and there are many entries for works "in preparation," such as *Classical Scholarship 1900-1950* (M. Platnauer), a history of Corinthian pottery (J. L. Benson), a new edition of F. Heichelheim's *Wirtschaftsgeschichte*.

*Plan.* The plan, given *infra* under *Addenda*, is largely unchanged. It reflects good new work especially in the archaeological sections: Numismatics, for instance, is more elaborate. Music has been combined with Metre (81). Private Life (no heading), still mingled with civilization, might well have a section of its own. The subject is in a new phase, now that we have, though not

yet in Nairn, G. R. Davidson (Mrs. Weinberg), *Corinth XII* (1952), a publication, with photographs, of 2938 *Minor Objects*; A. N. Stillwell, *Corinth XV*, Parts I (1948) and II (1953); G. R. Davidson and D. B. Thompson, *Small Objects from the Pnyx*, I (*Hesperia* Suppl. VII [1943]). W. Deonna, *La Vie Privée des Déliens*, belongs less to Delos (130) as a colony than to private life in all Greece: the colony Delos ought to be, but is not, represented by P. Roussel's fine volume (97), and there should be a reference to Laidlaw's *Delos* (96). But Delos is also on p. 114, as a site. The plan is at fault, or if not then a cross-reference is needed. The arrangement as a whole is *sui generis*, and needs more subdivisions. If the headings and order of *L'Année Philologique* could be followed, additions would be easier.

*Format; Errata.* In edition 2, only the section "Greek and Latin Authors" was in two columns. Edition 3 has two columns throughout, so that the volume has 102 fewer pages; but the amount of print per page is much more than twice the amount on the generously spaced old one-column pages. It is not so easy to enter addenda in the margin. The volume weighs less, the dark blue color of the binding is another advance (but it curls), and boldface type makes scholars' names stand out. Nairn<sup>2</sup> had its share of petty errors; Nairn<sup>3</sup> has fewer. As before, grateful scholars will send Blackwell's all they find, but I give here some errors in names which might confuse (librarians spend fruitless hours on such matters):

Page 8, col. A, under Aeneas Tacticus, and also on 46A, for Onosander read Onasander.

Page 10, in each col., near top: for J. R. Edmonds read J. M. Edmonds.

Page 19, under Augustus, for H[enrica] Malcovati, read the un-Latinized form E[nrica], to agree with most of her published works; and a note explaining.

Page 35, first item: for Herodas read Hesiod.

Page 55, col. B, under *Lexicon*, for A. Lodge read G[onzales] Lodge.

Page 68, col. A, second entry, for H. N. van Essen read M. H. N. von Essen.

Page 79, col. B, second entry: with Debrunner name F. Stolz, who is put first.

Pages 93, first entry, 130 A, and 157 (index): E. Bickermann should be equated with E. Bikerman.

*Analyses; Prices; Editions.* Readers will use gratefully the up-to-date detailed list of the Michigan Papyri (p. 86), doubled since Nairn<sup>2</sup>; of (Christ-)Schmid-Stählin (73); of the *Kerameikos* series (114) and the *Etudes Crétoises* (118), of the whole *Corpus Vasorum* (126-127), of the *Sylloge Nummorum Graecorum* (141), and others. An analysis of *FGrHist* would be even more welcome. The Corinth and Dura series (114) also await treatment. It is important to indicate that final publications of the Athenian Agora and Dura excavations have begun to appear; for Dura also the Report for Season IX, Part 3, is missing. (A preliminary working bibliography of Dura would be useful.) Olynthus (115) should be put down as completely published; and D. M. Robinson should be named first, as both Editor and principal author (in the final volume, XIV, the press informs me, Robinson's name should appear on the title page as that of the Editor also of the series). At this writing, all the Olynthus volumes are still in print. In such instances, becoming rare (*infra*), the price of the whole, in addition to the prices of individual volumes, which are given at present, might conveniently be added; e.g. *Olynthus*, \$227.50. This is done for *IG* and *IG<sup>2</sup>*. Another service would be to indicate what new "editions" are exact duplicates of the previous edition: e.g. W. Pape-G. E. Benseler, *Eigen-namen*<sup>3</sup> (82) was merely reprinted later, so that 1863<sup>3</sup> = 1884<sup>4</sup>; for R. Cohen, *La Grèce*<sup>2</sup> (95), similarly, 1939<sup>2</sup> = 1948<sup>3</sup>. A. and M. Croiset was largely reprinted but only the earlier "editions" are mentioned in Nairn<sup>3</sup> (72). Actually, Vol. I: 1928<sup>4</sup> = 1910<sup>3</sup>; II: 1928<sup>4</sup> = 1914<sup>3</sup>; III: 1929<sup>4</sup> = 1913<sup>3</sup>; IV: 1921<sup>3</sup>, not reprinted; V: ed.<sup>3</sup> (n.d.) = 1901<sup>2</sup>.

*Importance; Scope; Peripheral Fields.* This is one of the few volumes which can and should belong to everyone in the profession. It is the friend of scholar and student, intelligent layman, librarian, and bookseller. Being selective and excluding articles, it serves scholars mostly in fields outside their own specialties. Its principal function is introductory. In view of this, its usefulness could well be extended to the antecedent and peripheral fields where introductions are especially needed: e.g. Anthropology, the Neolithic cultures, the European cultures of the Bronze and Iron Ages, and the Ancient East. There are at present a few such titles under History; they,

with some more, could well be put under separate headings. Similarly, an introductory page of *OT* and *NT* material is needed: in the avoidance of Christian material, important papyrological works such as e.g. J. H. Moulton-G. Milligan, *The Vocabulary of the Greek Testament* (1952) are omitted. Early Christian writers like Clement of Alexandria are also left out, even though they are not in Blackwell's *Byzantine Hand-List*. Classicists do read them. Nor should it be an insuperable task to introduce the periods and literatures which followed in the West.

*Books of Photographs.* The distinction between volumes of photographs valuable for scientific study, and picture-books valuable for all the purposes of fine pictures, is usually a clear distinction. W. Hege's superb volumes bridge the gap, and are in (114, 115), and now we have the incomparable Skira volumes with color, *Etruscan Painting* (128), and A. Maiuri's *Roman Painting* (add; 1953). But there should be a section for the new genre: picturebooks of Greece and Italy, e.g. Jerome Hill, *Trip*

THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY is published weekly from mid-November for sixteen issues, except for any weeks in which there is an academic vacation. Volume 48 contains issues dated December 13 (1954); January 3, 10, 24, 31; February 14, 28; March 7, 14, 21, 28; April 18, 25; May 2, 9, 16 (1955).

Owner and Publisher, The Classical Association of the Atlantic States. Place of publication, Fordham University, 441 East Fordham Road, New York 58, N. Y.

General subscription price, \$3.75 per volume in the Western Hemisphere; elsewhere \$4.25. Price to members of the C. A. A. S., \$3.25. All subscriptions run by the volume. Single numbers, to subscribers, 20 cents, to others, 30 cents prepaid (otherwise 30 cents and 40 cents). If affidavit to invoice is required, 60 cents must be added to the subscription price. For residents of New York, New Jersey, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Maryland, and the District of Columbia, a subscription to THE CLASSICAL WEEKLY (or, alternatively, to the *Classical Journal*) is included in the membership fee of the C. A. A. S.; whose members may also take *Classical Outlook*, *Classical Journal*, and *Classical Bulletin* at special prices in combinations available from the Secretary-Treasurer of the C. A. A. S., F. Gordon Stockin, Houghton College, Houghton, N. Y.

Reentered as second class matter December 14, 1950 at the post office at New York, N. Y., under the Act of March 3, 1879. Acceptance for mailing at special rate of postage provided for in the Act of February 28, 1925 authorized December 14, 1950.

#### STAFF

##### EDITOR

Edward A. Robinson...Fordham University, New York 58, N. Y.

##### ASSOCIATE EDITOR

William H. Stahl....New York University, New York 53, N. Y.

##### CONTRIBUTING EDITORS

Lionel Casson.....New York University, New York 3, N. Y.

Philip Mayerson.....New York University, New York 3, N. Y.

Martin Ostwald.....Columbia University, New York 27, N. Y.

John F. Reilly.....Sacred Heart High School, Yonkers, N. Y.

to Greece (1936). The latest, with English text, is R. Warner-M. Hürlimann, *Eternal Greece* (1953), which students of sculpture will know already; the text however is for the "general reader." Any teacher who has even to mention Persia will be grateful to know of—though he cannot own—Erich F. Schmidt, *Flights over Iran* (1940); Nairn<sup>4</sup> will have his *Persepolis* (I: 1953). For Greece, F. Krischen's restorations (121), though drawings, should be mentioned with the other pictures. One fears that D. B. Thompson's scholarly *Catalogue of Visual Aids* (Oxford, Ohio: American Classical League, 1949; 50¢) is unknown abroad.

*Omissions of Festschriften.* Elsewhere I have urged that the detached Festschrift of miscellaneous contents is no unmixed boon to scholarship. There are some 530 Classical Festschriften, many of them not in series.\* It is potent evidence against detached miscellaneous Festschriften that Nairn,<sup>5</sup> though it contains thousands of titles, must turn its back on this vast body of material. The only Festschrift I have noted in the whole volume is *Anatolian Studies* for W. M. Ramsay, which is saved by its unity, but *Essays in Aegean Archaeology* for A. J. Evans is not in, nor *Athenian Studies* for W. S. Ferguson (*HSCP* Suppl. 1), nor the largely Athenian volume for T. L. Shear (*Hesperia* Suppl. VIII). Very few other Festschriften could be included.—The Index of Classical Festschriften by D. Rounds, now in preparation, will do what can be done to remedy a condition made clearer than ever by Nairn. A large number of Classical articles are listed in B. M. Metzger, *Index of Articles on the New Testament and the Early Church Published in Festschriften* (1951); and about 150 in H. Schleiffer-R. Crandall, *Index to Economic History Essays in Festschriften* (1953).

*The Number of Works Out of Print.* The new Nairn reinforces everyone's impression that far too many Classical volumes are out of print. The following examples come from the great section of Greek and Latin Authors. Omitting from the count, for simplicity, many-volumed editions in which some volumes are out of print and some are not, and including in the count Texts, General Homeric, Language, Homeric Archaeology, and all the other subdivisions under Homer (34-38), I count approximately 47 Homer items in print, 77 Homer items marked *o.p.* Of course books get supplanted, so that abstractly it might be no grave matter if some volumes are out of print. A few such titles may have been retained in Nairn, but this is supposed to be a useful, not an "historical," bibliography, and I think useless titles are few. Similarly with Vergil: take, arbitrarily, page 70, col. B, which happens to list General Vergiliana written by

scholars whose names come after Fiore and before Rand: out of 22 items, 8 are in print, 14 are not. Nairn<sup>2</sup>, the edition of 1939, happens also to have 22 items, with only one change between Fiore and Rand; out of the 22 items, 19 of the items were then in print, only 3 were not. Among less studied authors take Vitruvius (71): in 1939, seven items were listed, 5 of them in print, 2 not; in 1952, the very same seven items are given, there has been no reprinting, 4 of the 5 previously available have gone out; and so for Vitruvius one item alone is still in print, viz. F. Granger's none-too-good Loeb edition (add dates: I: 1931, reprinted 1945; II: 1934). These were random samplings: search will reveal worse, e.g. Plutarch, *Sophocles*.

*Addenda.* Any selective bibliography can easily be added to. What is rare is the robust good sense of J. A. Nairn and his sponsors which first brought this volume into being (1931) and has never been lost. The present review adds over 200 items, but it will be remembered that all Classical antiquity is involved, and that post-1952 (i.e. post-Nairn<sup>3</sup>) items are included, not for completeness—which is unattainable—nor merely because so many recent items are in print, but because they seemed worthy. About some, until time has sifted out the unworthy, there is room for disagreement.

Contributions to the following list have generously been made by W. M. Calder, III (almost the entire section on the Authors); M. H. Chambers (Thucydides); G. Downey; J. P. Elder (Palaeography); G. M. A. Hanfmann (Archaeology, part); E. A. Robinson; L. B. Urdahl. Calder has also beneficially read the typescript.

I. *Encyclopaedias*, etc. T. Klausner et al., *Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum* (13 fascs. now published: 1941- ). Consider also encyclopaedias for the neighboring fields: e.g. Cabrol-Leclercq for the Christian. For the Egyptian, H. Bonnet, *Reallexikon der Aegyptischen Religionsgeschichte* (1952); much Classical material and plenty of Egyptian besides cult; S. Morenz's review adds: *OLZ* 48 [1953] cols. 341-352.)

II. *Manuals; Collected Essays.* M. R. P. McGuire, *Introduction to Classical Scholarship: a Syllabus and Bibliographical Guide* (Catholic University, Washington, D.C. 1950 [being revised]; mimeographed).

M. P. Nilsson, *Opuscula Selecta* (I: 1951; II: 1952).

III (pp. 3-7). *Collections.* The abbreviations should stand in the margins. A seventh edition of *FdI'* (5) is announced. A. Klotz, *Tragicorum Romanorum Fragmenta* (Teubner; replaces Ribbeck I). L. Radermacher, *Artium Scriptores* (1951).

III (pp. 7-72). *Authors.* Aeschylus: edited, with translation into Italian, by M. Untersteiner (3 vols.: 1947), who also compiled a *Guida Bibliografica ad Eschilo* (1947). P. Groeneboom, *Choephoroi* (1949).

\* See D. Rounds and S. Dow, "Festschriften," *Harvard Library Bulletin* 8 (1954) 283-298. There are, in addition, about 75 Festschriften in Roman Law.

- Aesop: B. E. Perry, *Aesopica*, I (1952).
- Anacreontea: J. M. Edmonds, *Elegy and Iambus* II (Loeb 1931).
- Antiphon: K. J. Maidment in *Minor Attic Orators* I (Loeb 1941).
- Apicius: M. E. Milham, *A. Glossarial Index to De re coquinaria* (five microcards: no. UWP-52: Madison, Wis., 1952).
- Archimedes: Ivor Thomas, *Greek Mathematical Works*, II (Loeb 1941). Entries should be added for the other writers in this collection.
- Aristophanes: W. W. Merry's texts have notes sufficiently valuable to justify including them.
- Aristotle, *Metaphysics*: edited with commentary by J. Tricot (2 vols.: 1952); edition by W. W. Jaeger (*OCT*, in preparation). *Ath.*: Nairn has the best of the 34 editions. Following the lead under Timotheus (68) add E. Scott, *Facsimile of Papyrus CXXXI in the British Museum*<sup>2</sup> (1891).
- Augustus: G. Pugliese Carratelli, *Imp. Caesaris Augusti Codex Rerum a Se Gestarum, con note* (1947).
- An entry "Carmina Epigraphica" *vel sim.* ought to appear, with a cross-reference on 88.
- Cicero: a survey of recent studies, *CW* 47 (1953/54) 129-139, by W. Allen, Jr.
- Ennius: text and commentary on the fragments of the *Annales* by L. Valmaggì (1945).
- Epistolai Erôtikai*: in A. R. Benner and F. H. Fobes, *Alciphron, etc.* (Loeb, 7, 9).
- Euripides: *A Concordance to Euripides*, by J. T. Allen and G. Italie (1954).
- Firmicius Maternus: K. Ziegler, *De Erroribus Profanarum Religionum* (1953).
- Herodotus: a survey of recent studies, *CW* 47 (1953/54) 145-152, by P. MacKendrick.
- Hesiod: A. Traversa, *Catalogi sive Eoearum fragmenta* (1951).
- Himerius (not in): *Declamationes et Orationes*, edited by A. Colonna (1951).
- Hippocrates: the Festugière item should state that he has a text, commentary, and translation into French of the *Peri Archaiês Iêtrikês* only. The Chadwick-Mann item (34B) is a translation into English. F. C. Unger: edition of *De Corde* with prolegomena and commentary (1923).
- Homer: V. Burr, *Neôn Katalogos* (Klio, Beiheft 49 [Neue Folge 36] 1944). S. E. Bassett, *The Poetry of Homer* (1938). Is not R. Lattimore's translation of the *Iliad* (1951) the best ever made into English?
- Juvenalis: edited by U. Knoche (1950); also with German metrical translation (1951). The latest edition of O. Jahn's edition is the fifth, by F. Leo (1932). G. Highet's *Juvenal the Satirist* (1954) has now been published.
- Livius Andronicus, translation of the *Odyssey*: edited by I. Borrelli (1951). Fragments, edited by M. L. de Gubernatis (1937).
- Laudatio Turiae* should be an entry, or itself an entry under some heading *Elogia* or *Panegyrici*; for such items as M. Durry, *Eloge Funèbre d'une Matrone Romaine* (1950); E. Galletier, *Panegyriques Latins* (I: 1949; II: forthcoming).
- Martialis: edited by C. Giarratano (1951).
- Manetho (no entry): edited by W. G. Waddell (Loeb, 1940); also in a forthcoming section of *FGrHist*.
- Minucius Felix, *Octavius*: edition and commentary by G. Quispel (1949).
- Ovid, *Amores*: text, Italian translation, notes by F. Munari (1951). E. K. Rand's essay *Ovid* (1925). R. J. Defarrari, M. I. Barry, M. R. P. Maguire, *A Concordance of Ovid* (1939).
- Pacuvius (no entry, though Accius receives one).
- Panaetius (no entry): the fragments are edited by M. van Straaten (1952), who also wrote *Panëtius, sa Vie, ses Ecrits, et sa Doctrine*, with an edition (1946).
- Peregrinatio Aetheriae*: H. Pétré, *Ethérie, Journal de voyage*, text and French translation (1948).
- Petronius, *Cena Trimalchionis*: text and commentary by E. V. Marmorale (1947).
- Philostratus and Philostratus Junior: move the *Imagines* to Philostratus Junior, or change to one heading, "Philostrateum Corpus," for both. Add A. Fairbanks, *Philostratus, Imagines; Callistratus, Descriptions* (Loeb, 1931); and A. R. Benner and F. H. Fobes, *Alciphron, Aelian, and Philostratus, The Letters* (Loeb, 1949).
- Pindar: B. Snell's edition is out (Teubner, 1953). A. Turyn's edition has been reprinted (1952). R. Lattimore's translation (1947). J. H. Finley's essay (forthcoming 1954).
- Plautus, *Mostellaria*: edition by E. H. Sturtevant (1925; reprinted 1936). *Truculentus*: edition by P. J. Enk (2 vols.: 1953).
- Plotinus: B. Mariën, *Bibliografia Critica degli Studi Plotiniani* (1949).
- Plutarch, *Vitae*: edition by B. Perrin (11 vols.: Loeb 1914-1926) is misplaced. *Demetrius Poliorcetes*: ed. E. Manni (1953). *Vita di Flaminio*: ed. S. Grevini (1952). On p. 58A (the Loeb) Babbitt translation is given but the title *Moralia* is omitted and the item is misplaced; it lacks the names of two editors, W. C. Helmbold and H. N. Fowler.
- Propertius: the *OCT* "edition" by J. S. Phillimore (1907) is a reprint of the first (1901). The second edition, by E. A. Barber, is imminent (1954). A. La Penna, *Propertio* (1951).
- Ptolemaeus: the *Syntaxis Mathematica* (60) is a work in 13 books on astronomy. Remove from under it "F. E. Robbins, Loeb" because this work is a text and translation of the *Tetrabiblos*, which is on astrology.

*Rhetorica ad Herennium*: there should be an entry s.v. referring to p. 24, under Cicero.

Sallust: A. D. Leeman, *A Systematical Bibliography of Sallust* (1952).

Sappho, with Alcaeus: ed. Gallavotti (Part I: 1947; Part II: 1948). Same, by D. L. Page (1954).

Seneca the Younger, *Apocolocyntosis*: Russo's translation is into Italian. *De Brevitate Vitae*: edition by H. Dahlmann (1949). *Oedipus*: edition with commentary by T. H. Sluiter (1941). *De Constantia Sapientis*: P. Grimal, edition with textual commentary (1953).

Sextus Empiricus: R. G. Bury's Loeb edition is in four vols. (1933-1949).

Sophocles: J. C. Kamerbeek has published the first vol. (1953), a commentary on the *Ajax*, in a series of eight. U. de Marco, *Scholium in Sophoclis Oedipum Coloneum* (1952). R. F. Goheen, *The Imagery of Sophocles' Antigone* (1951).

Suetonius, *De Augustus*: edition by M. A. Levi (1951).

Tacitus, *Agricola*: the edition by J. G. C. Anderson is of 1922. The edition by A. Gudeman, with the *Germania*, revised 1928, was reprinted in 1950.

Terence: edition with French translation and notes by J. Marouzeau (Budé: I, 1942; II, 1947; III, 1949). A new critical edition by S. Prete (1954).

Theocritus: edition by C. Gallavotti with Bucolic poets (1946); also his *Lingua, tecnica e poesia negli idilli di Teocrito* (1952).

Thucydides. Add the edition by K. W. Krüger: Band 1, Heft 1<sup>3</sup> (Books 1-2: 1860), Heft 2<sup>3</sup> (Books 3-4; ed. W. Pökel: 1885); Band 2, Heft 1<sup>2</sup> (Books 5-6: 1858), Heft 2<sup>2</sup> (Books 7-8: 1861). Classen-Steupe (67): Vol. I<sup>3</sup> (1919); Vol. II<sup>3</sup> (1914); Vol. III<sup>3</sup> (1892); Vol. IV<sup>3</sup> (1900); Vol. V<sup>3</sup> (1912); Vol. VI<sup>3</sup> (1905); Vol. VII<sup>3</sup> (1908); Vol. VIII<sup>2</sup> (1885). The 1942 Jones-Powell (67) was reprinted in 1949. A. W. Spratt, Book IV (1912), Book VI (1905). A. Madalena's edition (3 Vols.: 1951-1952). A. W. Gomme's *Commentary I* (67) was lithographically reprinted in 1950 with some corrections.

Tibullus: the OCT edition by J. P. Postgate was of 1915, reprinted 1924.

Varro: add a cross-reference to Hooper and Ash (Loeb 1934) under Cato (21A).

Vergil, *Eclogues*: H. J. Rose, *The Eclogues of Vergil* (1942).

Xenophanes: E. Diehl, *Anthologia Lyrica Graeca*, Vol. I, 1 (n.d.). G. S. Kirk, forthcoming.

Xenophon, *Symposium and Apology*: edition by O. J. Todd (Loeb 1922).

Xenophon Ephesius: English translation by M. Hadas, *Three Greek Romances* (1953).

IV. *Greek Literature*, Works on; and *Drama*. P. W. Harsh, *Handbook of Classical Drama* (1944). Enter a cross-reference to A. Wilhelm, *Urkunden* (90). K.

Rees, *The So-Called Rule of Three Actors* (1908). A. W. Gomme, *The Greek Attitude to Poetry and History* (1954). Surveys of recent work on classical Greek lyric, by G. M. Kirkwood, *CW* 47 (1953/54) 33-42, 49-54; on the ancient novel, by E. H. Haight, 46 (1952/53) 233-237.

V. *Latin Literature*, Works on. M. Platnauer, *Latin Elegiac Verse* (1951).

VI. *Philology and Grammar*. G. Ghedini, *Guide Bibliografiche*, I. *Filologia Classica* 5: *Lingua Graeca* (1943). H. and B. Riesenfeld, *Repertorium Lexicographicum Graecum* (1954) replaces H. Schoene's (1907; not in) but is not thorough: B. Einarson, *CP* 49 (1954) 195-196; W. M. Calder, III, and P. G. Manolis, *CW* (forthcoming). O. Gradenwitz, *Laterculi vocum Latinorum: Voces Latinae, et a Fronte et a Tergo* (1904). *Harpers' Latin Dictionary* (1907) should be mentioned, a version of Lewis and Short. Herbert Weir Smyth, *Greek Grammar* (not in): 1920; reprinting with revision under consideration. E. A. Hahn, *Subjunctive and Optative: Their Origin as Futures* (1953). N. Marinone-F. Guala, *Tutti i Verbi Greci* (1950). J. Marouzeau; *L'Ordre des Mots en Latin* (1953). M. Lejeune, *Traité de Phonétique grecque* (1947). Stephanus (80) is being reprinted. L. R. Palmer, *The Latin Language* (1953). A. Kolar, *De re metrica*, etc. (1947).

VII. *Palaeography*. J. P. Elder has kindly supplemented *per litt.* his own useful gathering of references in *Speculum* 24 (1949) 272-278. He suggests first a brief section on Guide-Books. Thus Nairn should have P. O. Kristeller, "Latin Manuscript Books before 1600: a Bibliography of the Printed Catalogues of Extant Collections," in *Traditio* 6 (1948) 227-317; others in Elder, *op. cit.* 276. Less necessary but still likely to be much used are lists of *initia*: A. Pelzer, "Répertoires d'incipit pour la littérature latine, philosophique et théologique du moyen âge," *RHE* 43 (1948) 493-512. A section on Mediaeval Libraries is also needed, with Dom L. H. Cottineau, *Répertoire topo-bibl. des abbayes et prieures* (1935-1937), and especially E. Lesne, "Histoire de la Propriété Ecclésiastique en France, IV: Les Livres, 'Scriptoria' et Bibliothèques," *Mémoires et Travaux Publiés par des Professeurs des Facultés Catholiques de Lille*, fasc. 46 (1938); also J. W. Thompson, *The Mediaeval Library* (1939). Among the items actually given—well-selected on the whole—the Mallon item (84) should be moved under Facsimiles (84-85), and the Bidez item (83) is not about mediaeval MSS, but about how to prepare texts for publication nowadays: it belongs in a section on methods of dealing with epigraphical, papyrological, and (other) palaeographical texts, etc. The worst defect is that no school is mentioned except the Beneventan (E. A. Lowe): add at least (full references in Elder 275): E. K. Rand on Tours, E. Carusi-W. M. Lindsay on Verona, L. W. Jones on Cologne;



above all Rodney P. Robinson on Visigothic; and a whole country in A. Bruckner, *Scriptoria Helvetica*.

VIII. *Papyrology*. M. David and B. A. van Groningen, *Papyrological Primer* (ed. 3: 1952). *Antinoopolis Papyri*, I, ed. C. H. Roberts, is of 1950 and is listed out of place. Add a cross-reference to E. Scott (*supra*, Aristotle). *Papyri Bononienses*, I ed. O. Montevecchi (1953). M. Hombert and C. Préaux, *Recherches sur le Recensement dans l'Égypte Romaine* (*Papyrologica Lugduno-Batava*, V: 1952; and the rest of this series).

IX. *Epigraphy*. *Actes du deuxième Congrès International d'Épigraphie Grecque et Latine, Paris 1952* (1953) will long be referred to in Classical studies; it provides for everyone a model of what such gatherings should do and should publish. The item *Année Épigraphique* (88) should be placed solely under Latin Inscriptions (91). *SEG* (90) is now to be edited by A. G. Woodhead, Corpus Christi College, Cambridge, England. Metrical inscriptions are left out: G. Kaibel, *Epigrammata Graeca* (1878); P. Friedländer and H. B. Hoffleit, *Greek Inscriptions in Verse, from the Beginnings to the Persian Wars* (1948). F. Buecheler-E. Engström, *Carmina Latina Epigraphica* (1911) is part of *Anthologia Latina* (3). T. Preger, *Inscriptiones Graecae Metricae ex Scripturis praeter Anthologiam Collectae* (1891). A. Wilhelm's largest volume is omitted, *Beiträge zur Griechischen Inschriftenkunde* (Sonderschriften des Oesterreichischen Archäologischen Institutes in Wien, VII: 1909). Not as good as Kirchner-Klaffenbach's *Imagines*<sup>2</sup> (89), but worthy, is P. Graindor, *Album d'Inscriptions attiques d'Époque Impériale* (1924). It would be convenient to group with the *Athenian Tribute Lists* (add Vol. IV [1953] and total cost, \$50) the books which virtually are parts of it, not re-worked in *ATL* itself, viz. *Assessment* (1934) and *Documents* (1937). L. Robert's *Bibliographie et Index 1924-1937* (1937) must be included, and a cross-reference to his other works which are included; *Études Épigraphiques et Philologiques* (1938) should go in. J. V. A. Fine, *Horoi* (*Hesp.*, Suppl. IX: 1951) and M. I. Finley, *Land and Credit* (n. d. [1952]) should go together here or under History. Marcadé (*infra*) will need a cross-reference, as does Ernout (7, but out of its alphabetical order).

X. *History and Civilization*. The bibliographies of *CAH* (some volumes to be re-issued in 1954), and the bibliographical works of R. Cohen (95) and A. Piganiol (101) should be mentioned under the headings. I have not yet seen the second edition of H. Bengtson, *Einführung*. V. Childe, *Prehistoric Migrations in Europe* (1950). J. H. Oliver, *Athenian Expounders* (110) should be moved to 107. Busolt-Swoboda (107) has a third, *Register* volume, by F. Jandebur (1926). E. Meyer-H. E. Stier, *Geschichte des Altertums* (94): the most recent editions, as announced for 1953-

1954: I, 1-2<sup>o</sup>; II, 1-2<sup>o</sup>; III, 3<sup>a</sup>; IV, 1-2<sup>a</sup>. To Kirchner's *PA* (96) add J. Sundwall's *Nachträge* (1910) and the *Hesperia Index* (1946), also Helen B. Pope, *Foreigners in Attic Inscriptions* (1947). N. G. L. Hammond, a history of Greece (in preparation). G. M. Calhoun, *Athenian Clubs in Politics and Litigation* (1913). J. O. Lofberg, *Sycophancy in Athens* (1917). R. Cohen's *Athènes* (95) is too slight. S. Accame, *La Lega Ateniese del s. IV a. C.* (1941). C. A. Roebuck, *Messenia 369-146 B.C.* (1941). J. A. O. Larsen, studies of representation in the Greek states, history of the Greek Leagues (in preparation). Chronology: transfer to p. 93 W. S. Ferguson, *Tribal Cycles* (107); add P. Graindor, *Chronologie* (1922: *Mémoires de l'Académie de Belgique* for 1921), with a note that J. H. Oliver, *HTR* 43 (1950) 233-235, will lead to subsequent revisions, chiefly his and J. A. Notopoulos'. Tarn's *Alexander* (97) = II<sup>2</sup>, 1950. C. A. Robinson, Jr., *The History of Alexander the Great*, I (sources in translation: 195<sup>o</sup>). M. Hammond, *City-State and World State* (1951). P. Graindor's *Hérode Atticus et sa Famille* (1930) is omitted but is virtually part of the series on p. 95. Ruth M. Brown, *A Study of the Scipionic Circle* (Iowa Studies 1934). J. André, *La Vie et l'Oeuvre de C. Asinius Pollio* (1949). M. Reinhold, *Marcus Agrippa* (1933); R. Daniel, *M. Vipsanius Agrippa* (1933). C. N. Cochrane, *Christianity and Classical Culture* (103) was re-issued with some revision in 1944. M. A. Levi, *Il Tempo di Augusto* (1951). L. Pareti, *Storia di Roma e del Mondo Romano* (3 vols.: 1952).

XI. *Archaeology and Art*. R. Carpenter, *Aesthetic Basis* (1921), unrivalled.

Athens: though it is a periodical, *Hesperia*, *passim*. Ida T. Hill, *The Ancient City of Athens* (1953). C. Waldstein (Walston), *Argive Heraeum* (I: 1902; II: 1905).

Minoan-Mycenaean: G. Karo, *Die Schachtgräber von Mykenai* (2 vols.: 1930, 1933); *Führer durch Tiryns* (1934). H. J. Kantor, *The Aegean and the Orient in the Second Millennium B.C.* (1947). On Minoan and on Mykenaean writing, chiefly Emmett L. Bennett, Jr., *The Pylos Tablets* (1951) and *A Minoan Linear B Index* (1953). As yet there are few books. For bibliography on Minoan writing, see *AJA* 58 (1954) 79-85; add, in a new periodical, *Minos* 2 (1953; publ. 1954), 89-111. J. D. S. Pendelbury, *Aegyptiaca* (1930).

Etruscan: G. M. A. Hanfmann, *Altetruskische Plastik*, I (1936). M. Pallotino, *L'Origine degli Etruschi* (1947). English edition of Pallotino (128), *Etruscan Painting* (Skira: 1952). P. J. Riis, *An Introduction to Etruscan Art* (1953).

Architecture: it should say just under the heading—cf. J. J. E. Hondius, *Saxa Loquuntur* for Epigraphy (88)—that W. B. Dinsmoor (121) has the best bibliography of the subject ever compiled (*Architecture of Ancient Greece* [1950] 341-386).

Sculpture: G. M. A. Richter, *Kouroi* (1942); *Metro-politan Museum Catalogue* (forthcoming). M. Bieber, *Hellenistic Sculpture* (1953). K. Kluge and K. Lehmann-Hartleben, *Die Antike Grossbronzen* (3 vols. 1927). G. M. A. Hanfmann, *The Season Sarcophagus* (Dumbarton Oaks Studies, 2: 1951). J. Marcadé, *Recueil des Signatures* (I: 1953).

Painting: P. W. Lehmann, *Roman Wall Paintings from Boscoreale* (1953). C. M. Dawson, *Romano-Campanian Landscape Painting* (YCS 9). M. M. Gabriel, *Masters of Campanian Painting* (1952).

Terracottas: D. Burr (Thompson), *Myrina* (1934).

Vases: G. H. Chase, *Loeb Arretine* (1908), *Boston Arretine* (1916).

XII. *Greek Settlements; Roman Provinces, etc.* The heading should refer to M. I. Rostovtzeff, *SEHHW* (104) and *SEHRE* (106); and to T. Frank, *EHR* (105). G. F. Hill, *History of Cyprus*, I (1940). W. M. F. Petrie, E. A. Gardner, et al., *Naukratis* (I: 1886; II: 1888). R. E. M. Wheeler, *Beyond the Roman Empire* (1954).

XIII. *Numismatics.* S. P. Noe, *Hoards*<sup>2</sup> (1937). L. Robert, *Etudes de Numismatique Grecque* (1951).

XIV. *Religion, Mythology.* M. P. Nilsson's *History of Greek Religion* (145), always in English, and now in a second edition (1949: translated by F. J. Fielden), is a work quite distinct from his (larger) *Geschichte* (145), of which a second edition is in preparation for vol. I (1941). H. I. Bell, *Cults and Creeds in Graeco-Roman Egypt* (1953). J. Liegle, *Der Zeus des Phidias* (145) belongs under sculpture. T. A. Brady, *Reception of the Egyptian Cults by the Greeks* (1935). W. C. Greene, *Moira* (1944). L. R. Taylor, *The Cults of Ostia* (1912). J. G. Frazer, *Golden Bough* (13 vols.; 143; \$50), reprinted 1951. E. J. and L. Edelstein, *Asclepius, A Collection and Interpretation of the Testimonies* (2 vols.: 1945).

XV. *Philosophy.* W. W. Jaeger, *The Theology of the Early Greek Philosophers* (1949). Survey of recent work on Pre-Socratics, by E. L. Minar, Jr., *CW* 47 (1953/54) 161-170, 177-182.

XVI. *Science, etc.* Engineering and Applied Science: add refs. to editions of Vitruvius, to Architecture, and to M. E. Blake, *Roman Construction* (121). A. Seidensticker, *Waldgeschichte des Alterthums* (1886). E. Ardaillon, *Les Mines du Laurion* (1897). O. Neugebauer, *The Exact Sciences in Antiquity* (1951).

XVII. *Geography.* Atlas: H. Bengtson and V. Milojicic, for the Bayerischer Schulbuch-Verlag, *Grosser Historischer Weltatlas, I: Vorgeschichte und Altertum* (2 fascs.: 1953). On the *Tabula Imperii Romani*, see now F. W. Adams, *AJA* 58 (1954) 45-51.

*Periodicals.* Three full pages (153-156) list exactly 100 periodicals. This is 26 more than 13 years earlier. As before, usually the title is followed by the organization, the date of the first issue, the number of issues *per annum* or the latest issue if issues are irregular, and the price of the latest or of a subscription. Grateful indeed, one wants more: there is no other such list. Yet to compile a longer one with fuller details is a forbidding task. I therefore venture to suggest that each journal print its own bibliographical record. No one else can do it accurately. An effort of this sort by the undersigned, for the *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*, printed in Vol. 60 [1951] 305-306, "Notes for Readers and for Librarians" (add now Vol. 61 of 1953), will at least show what might be done.

Above all, add indexes and supplements. *Hesperia* will illustrate: its Supplements make up an important part of the series, but they are of course not mentioned on p. 154; Suppl. IV, H. A. Thompson's *Tholos*, is on p. 114 without mention of *Hesperia*; mention of Suppl. I has been added on p. 90, but it is assigned, wildly, to the entry preceding its proper title. No others are in, not R. S. Young's *Late Geometric Graves* (II: 1939), G. P. Stevens' *Setting of the Parthenon* (III: 1940), W. B. Dinsmoor's *Observations on the Hephaisteion* (V: 1941), nor J. H. Oliver's *Sacred Gerousia* (VI: 1941). L. I. Highby's *Erythrae Decree* (96) is as much a Beiheft of *Klio* as are two items in the next column.

Abbreviations of periodicals might go into future Nairns. The standard *AJA* list of abbreviations, 56 (1952) 1-7 (now being revised) had 497 serials. Many of these are not classical, but clearly the Nairn list should be longer. The Chester and other local English Archaeological Societies ("Members only") may stay, but (using the *AJA* abbreviations), *AJNum*, *AnnPhil*, *ArchDelt*, *HTR*, *MCI*, *OpusArch*, and *TAPA* might be a minimum of additions. *AM* and *RM* (155) seem not to be distinguishable.

*The Index of Scholars.* The volume contains some cross-references; the intent was to list each work only once. M. Hammond's *Augustan Principate* is entered twice: on p. 99 the price is 24s., on p. 108 the price has advanced to 25s. Another duplication is M. van der Mijnsbrugge, *The Cretan Koinon* (96 and 107). As before, the works listed are all books; no article is admitted.

The Index of (modern) Authors (157-164) is an excellent new feature, useful, errorless in scores of instances tested, and also amusing, since it constitutes a limited sort of *Who's Who*, the only one there is, of the profession. It does not include, though it should, the editors of Classical texts, and authors of volumes in certain series; hence, among the 2000 names, some notable ones are wholly absent. The number of entries has limited significance, because any given page entry may stand for several volumes all listed on that one page.

Within these limitations, it is interesting to see who has the most entries. The reader will have guessed: Wilamowitz. He appears on 18 pages (74 repeats 67). His nearest rivals are J. Carcopino, 10 (allowing for a duplication, pp. 94 and 95), and E. Norden, 10; but such smaller figures mean much less: T. Mommsen has only 5 (one is a cross-reference; but correct the Index, which should make no distinction between T. and Th. Mommsen), A. Wilhelm has 2. The contest is Panhellenic: first place alone counts. When all is said, and no one would urge more earnestly than I would that there is much to be said, Ulrich von Wilamowitz-Moellendorff was greatest in a majority of the essential dimensions.

\* \* \*

There is a saying of Wilamowitz, which I owe to W. W. Jaeger, his successor: *Das Bessere ist des Guten Feind*. No saying is more applicable to a selective bibliography—or, for better or worse, to a review of one.

STERLING DOW

HARVARD UNIVERSITY

#### NOTICE TO READERS AND LIBRARIANS

Octo quod legitis, boni patroni,  
 Paginas, modo sedecim legentes,  
 Non incuria non dolus putandum est:  
 Unum hoc perfugium est datum editori  
 Salvis legibus ut legatis ullas.  
 Quas si bis (fere digna quae legantur  
 Insunt) legeritis benigniusque,  
 Perfectus numerus profecto habetur.  
 Posthac, credite, sedecim legentes,  
 Sedenas numerabitis viritim.

If you are using

#### **Using Latin, Book One**

Scott, Foresman and Company's great new first year text  
 by Scott, Horn, and Gummere

#### **Or if you would like some good extra reading**

we are happy and proud to offer you on 35 mm. filmstrips the complete stories from this book, arranged by Waldo E. Sweet, Ph.D., Director of the Latin Workshop, Program of Linguistics, University of Michigan

#### **A Teacher's Guide Book of instructions**

is available to help you in teaching your students to learn how to read Latin according to the principles of scientific linguistics.

*Write us for further details and prices.*

### **TUTOR THAT NEVER TIRES, INC.**

BRONXVILLE 8, NEW YORK

"RESPONDE MIHI" Recordings

"TEXT THAT TALKS" Filmstrips